

PROJECT REVIEW REPORT

This document tracks the findings raised in Verra's review of the project specified below. The VVB must address the findings before the project request can be considered by Verra for approval. The document will be made publicly available on the Verra Registry. Confidential information may be provided as separate attachments.

Review Type	Verification
Project ID	733
Project Name	Biomass based steam generation project by Gujarat Ambuja Exports Ltd.
Program(s)	VCS
Verification Period	01 January 2014 – 31 March 2018
Project Proponent	Gujarat Ambuja Exports Limited
Methodology	AMS I.C, Thermal energy production with or without electricity, version 16
VVB	LGAI Technological Center, S.A. (Applus+ Certification)
Assessment Criteria	VCS Standard, v4.3, AMS I.C, v16
Date of First Issue	04 October 2022
Review Conclusion	On 21 December 2022 Verra completed the review of the Project Review Report. The updates were sufficient to close all findings. The review is now closed.
Date of Final Issue	21 December 2022

ASSESSMENT FINDINGS

#	Description	Response	Status
1	Missing project implementation dates Issue: The project proponent has not listed key implementation dates of the project activity in section 1.1 of the monitoring report. Action required: The PP is requested to update section 1.1 of the monitoring report to include the key implementation dates of the project. Program rule: Section 1.1 of the <i>VCS Monitoring Report Template, v4.1</i>	Round1: VVB Response: The PP has included the Start date of commercial operation in the section 1.1 of the updated MR version 1.2. FVR section 4.1 has been updated for Start date of commercial operation and also mentioned in section 1.4 of the FVR. Verra Review: The PP has updated section 1.1 of the monitoring report and provided the start date when the steam boiler began commercial operation (i.e., 27 March 2008).	Closed
2	Project description deviation not reported Issue: “Emergent Ventures India Pvt. Ltd.” is listed in section 1.4 of the monitoring report as an entity in the project but is not listed in the registered PD. Furthermore, the VVB has not mentioned or assess Emergent Ventures India Pvt. Ltd. joining the project as a project description deviation in the verification report. Action required: 1. The project proponent is requested to update section 3.2 of the monitoring report given a new entity has joined the	Round1: VVB Response: 1. The PP has removed the Information of Emergent Ventures India Pvt. Ltd. from section 1.4 to make it consistent with the registered PD. 2. No action is required further in the FVR. Verra Review: 1. The PP has updated section 1.4 of the monitoring report and removed “Emergent Ventures India Pvt. Ltd.” as an entity involved in the project. No further action is required.	Closed

ASSESSMENT FINDINGS

- project and report this as a PD deviation.
2. The VVB must ensure to demonstrate and assess this project description deviation in section 3.3 of the verification report.
 2. The VVB clarified that “Emergent Ventures India Pvt. Ltd.” has been removed from section 1.4 of the monitoring report. Thus, no project description deviation has been reported. No further action is required.

Program rule:

Section 3.2 of the *VCS Monitoring Report Template, v4.1* and section 3.3 of the *VCS Verification Report Template, v4.1*

3	Insufficient information on the quality control measures implemented	Round1:	Closed
Issue:	The project proponent has not provided sufficient information to describe the quality control measures implemented by the project. The project proponent mentions “corrective action” but does not provide information on what such actions entail.	VVB Response: The VVB team would like to clarify that this is an edit error. The text meant to suggest that a corrective action will be taken if instruments are found to be not working properly which is retesting/recalibration of instrument or replacing with the correct ones. The PP has corrected the text in MR is edited to reflect so.	
Action required:	The project proponent is requested to update section 4.3 of the monitoring report and describe, in more detail the quality control measures implemented by the project including the corrective action taken.	Verra Review:	
Program rule:	Section 4.3 of the <i>VCS Monitoring Report Template, v4.1</i>	Section 4.3 of the monitoring report has been updated as requested; no further action is required.	
4	Sustainable development contributions “Contributions Over Project Lifetime”	Round1:	Closed
Issue:		VVB Response: The PP has corrected the section 1.11 of the MR and included the requirements about "Contributions Over Project	

ASSESSMENT FINDINGS

The project proponent has provided the SDG contributes for the project's crediting period rather than during this monitoring period.

Action required:

The project proponent is requested to update section 1.11 of the monitoring report, specifically the column "Contributions Over Project Lifetime" to include the GHG ERRs for this monitoring period (i.e., 55,888 tCO₂e).

Program rule:

Section 1.11 of the *VCS Monitoring Report Template, v4.1* and section 3.16.1 *VCS Standard, v4.3*

Lifetime". Same has been verified and disused under section 1.4 of the FVR.

Verra Review:

Section 1.11 of the monitoring report has been updated as requested; no further action is required.

5 No mention of breakdowns throughout monitoring period

Issue:

The project proponent has not mentioned the equipment breakdowns that occurred during this monitoring period.

Action required:

1. The project proponent is requested to update section 3.1 of the monitoring report to include the breakdowns that have impacted the GHG ERRs during this monitoring period.
2. The VVB must ensure to update section 4.1 of verification report
3. The VVB must ensure to update section 4.1 and assess the breakdowns in this monitoring period.

Program rule:

Round1:

VVB Response:

1. The PP has provided the outage details in Appendix II of monitoring report already. The Section 3.1 of MR refers to this detail.
2. The section 4.1 of the FVR has been corrected for breakdowns.
3. The section 4.1 of the FVR discussed an assessment of breakdowns fall under current monitoring period.

Verra Review:

1. The PP has updated section 3.1 of the monitoring report.
2. The VVB has updated section 4.1 of the verification report.
3. The VVB has also provided an assessment opinion on the breakdowns that occurred. No further action is required.

Closed

ASSESSMENT FINDINGS

Section 3.1 of the *VCS Monitoring Report Template, v4.1* and section 4.1 of the *VCS Verification Report Template, v4.1*

6	No mention of socioeconomic impacts of project Issue: The project proponent has only mentioned the environmental impact, but not socioeconomic impact of the project. Action required: The project proponent is requested to update section 2.1 of the monitoring report to include the socioeconomic impacts of the project. Program rule: Section 2.1 of the <i>VCS Monitoring Report Template, v4.1</i>	Round1: VVB Response: The PP has provided the additional information in the section 2.1 of MR. there are no negative impact of the project on socio-economic aspect. FVR section 4.2.1 has been updated accordingly. Verra Review: Section 2.1 of the monitoring report has been updated as requested; no further action is required.	Closed
7	Insufficient information for baseline emissions, project emissions and net GHG ERRs Issue: The project proponent has only provided sample calculations in sections 5.1, 5.2 and 5.4 of the monitoring report along with a supporting spreadsheet. A third-party is unable to reproduce the calculation. Action required: 1. The project proponentis requested to provide sufficient information (i.e., data	Round1: VVB Response: 1. The PP has provided a calculation for clarity on the equations applied and method of using measured data to arrive at the results. This has to be read alongside ER sheet where details are provided including calculation and data measured. Now, it is very much traceable and can be reproduced. 2. FVR section 4.4 has been updated. Verra Review: 1. Sections 5.1, 5.2 and 5.4 of the monitoring report have	Closed

ASSESSMENT FINDINGS

- for key parameters, key equations, annual calculations) so that a third-party may reproduce the calculation.
- The VVB must ensure to update section 4.4 of verification report as necessary.

Program rule:

Sections 5.1, 5.2 and 5.4 of the *VCS Monitoring Report Template, v4.1*

been updated with sufficient information to allow a third-party to reproduce the calculations. No further action is required.

- Section 4.4 of the verification report has been updated as requested; no further action required.

8 Missing GHG ERRs for 2018 with no justification

Round1:

Closed

Issue:

Section 5.4 of the monitoring report, the net GHG ERRs table shows that no GHG ERRs were generated for 2018. However, the project proponent does not provide any explanation for the missing data during that year.

Action required:

- The project proponent must update sections 3.1 and 5.4 of the monitoring report to include an explanation for the missing GHG ERRs in 2018.
- The VVB must update section 5 of verification report with an assessment opinion.
- The VVB must update section 5 of the verification report with an assessment opinion on the missing data/GHG ERRs during 2018.

Program rule:

Sections 3.1 and 5.4 of the *VCS Monitoring Report Template, v4.1*. Section 5 of the *VCS Verification report Template, v4.1*

VVB Response:

- The project plant was not operated at all during 2018 and hence no data has been collected during the year. The reason is also presented in section 5.4 of MR. in response to the comment; appropriate text is appended in section 3.1 of the MR too.
- FVR section 5 has been updated accordingly.
- FVR section 5 has been updated accordingly.

Verra Review:

- The PP has updated section 3.1 and 5.4 of the monitoring report and included an explanation for the missing GHG ERRs in 2018.
- The VVB has updated the same in section 5 of the verification report.
- The VVB has updated section 5 of the verification report and provided an assessment opinion on the missing data/GHG ERRs during 2018. No further action is required.

ASSESSMENT FINDINGS

9	No indication on ETs or other environmental credits Issue: The VVB has not indicated in the verification report whether the project is included in an ETS or sought/received other environmental credits. Action required: The VVB must ensure to update section 3.1 of the verification report and clearly state whether the project is included in an ETS or sought/received other environmental credits. Program rule: Section 3.1 of the VCS <i>Verification Report Template</i>, v4.1	Round1: VVB Response: FVR section 3.1 has been updated discussed as there is no ETS or sought/received other environmental credits for this project. Verra Review: The VVB has updated section 3.1 of the verification report and stated that “The project proponent has provided a self-declaration in this regard which confirms that project proponent will not claim Emission reductions for current monitoring period 01-January-2014 to 31-March-2018 (including both days) under any other GHG program except VCS, hence accepted by the assessment team.” No further action is required.	Closed
10	Missing qualifications or limitations of the quantity of GHG ERRs achieved Issue: The VVB does not discuss the GHG ERRs achieved during this verification period relative to the estimated net GHG ERRs in the registered PD. Action required: The VVB must ensure to update section 5 of verification report and discuss the GHG ERRs achieved in the verification period relative to the estimated net GHG ERRs estimated. Program rule: Section 5 of the VCS <i>Verification Report Template</i>, v4.1	Round1: VVB Response: The section 5 of the FVR has been included the discussion on GHG ERRs achieved in the verification period relative to the estimated net GHG ERRs estimated. Verra Review: The VVB has updated section 5 of verification report and briefly discussed the GHG ERRs achieved during this verification period relative to the estimated net GHG ERRs estimated; no further action is required.	Closed

