

VCS PROJECT REVIEW REPORT

Project ID	1671
Project Name	<i>Wind based power generation by Panama Wind Energy Private Limited in Maharashtra, India</i>
Project Proponent	<i>Panama Wind Energy Private Limited</i>
Methodology	<i>ACM0002, Grid-connected electricity generation from renewable sources. Version 12.3.0</i>
Sectoral Scope(s)	1
Validation/Verification Body (VVB)	<i>Carbon Check (India) Private Ltd</i>
Registry	<i>Markit</i>

Assessment Criteria	<i>VCS Standard, v3.6</i>
Date of First Issue	04 April 2017
Date of Final Issue	05 April 2017

Summary:

An accuracy review of the Wind based power generation by Panama Wind Energy Private Limited in Maharashtra, India registration and issuance request has been conducted by VCS in accordance with Section 4.3 of the *Registration and Issuance Process*.

The accuracy review has raised 2 assessment findings and 1 minor findings, detailed below. The VVB, in coordination with the project proponent, is hereby required to provide a response to the assessment findings presented in Section 1. The 2 assessment findings must be addressed to the satisfaction of VCS. The VVB need not address the minor findings during this review. Please note, however, that where VCS finds consistent minor findings by the VVB in future reviews, minor findings shall be escalated to assessment findings.

This findings report may be made publically available. Confidential information may be provided as separate attachments.

1 ASSESSMENT FINDINGS

Finding 1

Section 3.11.10 of the *VCS Standard, v3.6* requires that the gap project description include sections 1.2, 1.3, 1.5, 1.6, 1.7, 1.9, 1.10, 1.12.1, 1.12.2, 1.12.3, 1.12.4 and 1.13 of the *VCS Project Description Template* and that the validation/verification body undertake a validation of same to provide a gap validation for the project's compliance with VCS rules.

Section 3 of the *VCS Verification Report Template, v3.4* requires that the VVB provide details of all validation activities that took place during the verification, such as gap validation.

Section 3 of the VCS verification report identifies each of the required sections, but does not discuss and justify the acceptance of the following sections of the VCS project description:

1.3: Project Proponent

1.12.2: Emissions Trading Programs and Other Binding Limits

The VVB is required to identify, discuss and justify its assessment of each section of the VCS project description listed above and update the project documentation as required. Particularly for Section 1.12.2, please discuss whether any emission trading programs or binding limits exist.

VVB Response:

VVB is submitting revised VCS Verification Report with corrections in section 3 (including assessments for 1.3 and 1.12.2).

VCS Response:

Section 3 of the VCS verification report identifies, discusses and justifies the following sections of the VCS project description:

1.3: Project Proponent

1.12.2: Emissions Trading Programs and Other Binding Limits

This finding is closed and no further action is required.

Finding 2

Section 1.13 (Additional Information Relevant to the Project) of the project description, specifically the fourth paragraph (Sustainable Development), includes several references to benefits that will be provided through solar power generation. It is not clear if additional activities utilizing solar power will take place or if solar power generation is part of the projects GHG reduction activities.

The projects proponent shall revise section 1.13 of the project description, and any other project documentation if needed, to provide more detail on the solar power activities, or remove the references if made in error.

VVB Response:

PP has submitted revised VCS PD with correction (solar was a typographical error which has been replaced with wind).

VCS Response:

Section 1.10 and 1.13 of the project description no longer contain references to solar power activities.

This finding is closed and no further action is required.

3 MINOR FINDINGS

Finding 1

Section 5.2.3 of the VCS Standard, v3.6 requires that projects shall be listed on the VCS project pipeline before the opening meeting between the VVB and project proponent.

Validation and verification documents were submitted at the same as pipeline listing documents, indicating that the project was not listed on the project pipeline prior to the opening meeting between the VVB and project proponent.

The VVB is required to follow all requirements of the VCS Standard for future validations, including ensuring projects are listed on the VCS project pipeline prior to beginning validation services.

Failure to ensure projects are listed on the pipeline prior to starting validation activities may result in punitive actions taken against the VVB in the future.

4 ASSESSMENT CONCLUSION

On 4 April 2017, VCS issued the report with two findings and one minor finding. The findings were caused by a lack of detail regarding validation findings in the verification report and the inclusion of non-project activities in the project description. The minor finding was related to a pipeline listing violation.

On 5 April 2017, the VVB submitted a revised verification report detailing how the validation findings were justified and the project proponent submitted a revised project description with no references to other project activities.

The VVB verbally verified the date of the opening meeting with the project proponent took place after the project was listed on the project pipeline. For this reason the minor finding is withdrawn.

On 5 April 2017, VCS closed all findings and no further action was required by the VVB.