QUALITY REPORT

Qianbei Afforestation Project

VCS-2082 · VCS · China

Report ID: CM-71E3CE0B · Generated: 2026-04-19 · Scoring Methodology: General v2.0

3.5 Overall Score out of 10	Integrity (35%)	3.7
	Transparency (25%)	4.8
	Claim Safety (25%)	2.1
	Documentation (15%)	3.4

Weights: Integrity 35% · Transparency 25% · Claim Safety 25% · Documentation 15%

Assessment Summary

This is a removal project with some strong integrity signals, including VVB-confirmed additionality, a 10% buffer pool, and no reversal events reported. However, the record has low extraction confidence, several unresolved or conflicting items, and limited visibility on key MRV details, which weakens confidence in the claimed credits.

Project Details

Registry	Verra (VCS)
Registry ID	VCS-2082
Sector	arr
Country	China
Vintage	2021
Project Methodology	AR-ACM0003 Version 2.0.0
Crediting Period	2016 — 2044
VVB	TÜV NORD CERT GmbH
Monitoring Period	2022 — 2022
Confidence	Medium
Documents Reviewed	57 documents reviewed
Scored	2026-04-19

Red Flags

- ■ Registry status: WITHDRAWN — project withdrawn from the registry (terminal)
- ■ Low extraction confidence and multiple assessment findings reduce trust in the documentation.
- ■ Conflicting records on leakage treatment, additionality test type, CCP status, and crediting period indicate reliability issues.

Score Breakdown

Integrity — 3.7 / 10

+ Additionality was confirmed by TÜV NORD CERT GmbH, and the project uses a combined additionality test under AR-ACM0003.

- The stakeholder consultation record reports eight assessment findings and one minor finding, and the extracted record shows contradictory leakage and additionality entries.

The project has moderate integrity support because the verification record identifies TÜV NORD CERT GmbH and confirms additionality through a combined test, while the project also maintains a 10% buffer pool. No reversal events are reported in the extracted record, which is favorable for an afforestation project. That said, the stakeholder consultation material reports eight assessment findings and one minor finding, which weakens confidence in the robustness of the project claims.

Transparency — 4.8 / 10

+ The monitoring period is stated for 2022, and the VVB is identified as TÜV NORD CERT GmbH.

- Total verified and claimed emission removals are not stated in the extracted record, and the extraction confidence is low.

Transparency is mixed because the monitoring period for 2022 and the VVB are identified, but the extracted record does not state the total verified or claimed removals. The monitoring approach for usage is also not found in the available documents, and the minimum extraction confidence is low, indicating at least one key source was difficult to read. These gaps reduce the ability to independently trace the crediting claim end to end.

Claim Safety — 2.1 / 10

+ The project reports a quantified leakage deduction of 0% and a 10% buffer pool, which helps limit over-crediting and permanence risk.

- The record contains contradictions on leakage treatment, and the baseline is project-specific rather than a more conservative jurisdictional baseline.

Claim safety is moderate at best. The project reports a quantified leakage deduction of 0% and a 10% buffer pool, but the record also contains a contradiction showing an earlier document said leakage was not addressed and another source indicated a 10% deduction. The baseline is project-specific, and the project is marked CORSIA-eligible, which keeps dual-market and over-crediting concerns from being fully resolved.

Documentation — 3.4 / 10

+ A large number of documents were used, and safeguards such as FPIC, grievance mechanism, and benefit sharing are described.

- The extraction confidence is low, and key fields such as verified removals, usage monitoring, and FNRB are not stated in available documents.

Documentation quality is limited by the low extraction confidence and missing key fields such as verified removals, FNRB, and usage monitoring method. On the positive side, the record indicates 56 documents were used, and safeguards are described, including FPIC, grievance mechanism, and benefit sharing. However, the presence of multiple findings and unresolved document inconsistencies means the file is not fully complete or clean.

Risk Indicators

● **Additionality**	VVB-confirmed additionality test
● **Permanence**	buffer pool present, no reversals reported
● **Leakage**	quantified but contradictory leakage treatment
● **Baseline**	project baseline with reassessment date stated
● **Safeguards**	FPIC and grievance mechanism documented
● **Double-claim**	CORSIA-eligible; CCP status unclear

What Would Improve This Score

→ Publish a clean, reconciled monitoring package with verified and claimed removals, leakage treatment, and the final crediting period clearly aligned across documents.

→ Provide a complete, readable VVB trail that resolves the contradictions on additionality, CCP status, and assessment findings, with explicit closure evidence for all issues.

Documents Reviewed

- VCS_ISS_REP_2082_01JAN2020_31DEC2020.pdf
- VCS_ISS_REP_2082_01JAN2016_31DEC2019.PDF
- V2_PRR_2082.docx
- CCB_MON_REP_ENG_DRAFT_2082_01JAN2020_31DEC2020_updated_clean.pdf
- CCB_MON_REP_ENG_DRAFT_2082_01JAN2021_31DEC2021.pdf
- CCB_MON_REP_SUM_CHI_DRAFT_2082_01JAN2020_31DEC2020.pdf
- Qianbei-MR_SUM-2nd-20211030_V04_clean.pdf
- CCB_MON_REP_ENG_DRAFT_2082_01JAN2016_31DEC2019_updated_clean.pdf
- CCB_MON_REP_ENG_DRAFT_2082_01JAN2022_31DEC2022.pdf
- CCB_MON_REP_SUM_CHI_DRAFT_2082_01JAN2016_31DEC2019.pdf
- CCB_MON_REP_ENG_2082_01JAN2016_31DEC2019.pdf
- Qianbei-MR_VCS_CCB-2nd-20211030_V04_clean.pdf
- CCB_MON_REP_ENG_DRAFT_2082_01JAN2016_31DEC2019.pdf
- CCB_MON_REP_SUM_CHN_2082_01012021_311212021_clean.pdf
- CCB_MON_REP_SUM_CHI_DRAFT_2082_01JAN2021_31DEC2021.pdf
- CCB_MON_REP_SUM_CHI_2082_01JAN2016_31DEC2019.pdf
- CCB_MON_REP_ENG_2082_01012021_31122021_clean .pdf
- CCB_MON_REP_SUM_CHI_DRAFT_2082_01JAN2022_31DEC2022.pdf
- AFOLU_PROJ_ELEM_ASSESSMENT_2082_14MAY2020.xls
- AFOLU_PROJ_ELEM_ASSESSMENT_2082_01JAN2016_31DEC2019.xls
- COMMS_AGR_PL2082_16DEC2019.pdf
- PP_LIST_REP_16DEC2019.pdf
- CCB_PROJ_DESC_SUM_CHI_DRAFT_PL2082_28NOV2019.pdf
- CCB_PROJ_DESC_SUM_CHI_2082_14MAY2020.pdf
- Qianbei-v2.kml
- CCB_PROJ_DES_SUM_CHI_DRAFT_16DEC2019.pdf
- AFOLU_PROJ_ELEM_2082_01JAN2016_31DEC2019.pdf
- R_2082_PRR_27JUL2020.pdf
- COMMS_AGR_2082_27AUG2021.PDF
- Qianbei_Afforestation_PD SUM_0728-updated.pdf
- Project Withdrawal Request Letter-2082(1).pdf
- VCS_REG_REP_2082_31JUl2020.PDF
- AFOLU Project Element Assessment
- VCS_REG_REP_2082_14MAR2020.PDF
- COMMS_AGR_2082_27AUG2021_updated.PDF
- CONFIRMATION LETTER_2082_07SEP2021.pdf
- CCB_ V3_Public Comments_2082.pdf
- Extension Approval_2082_14APR2020.pdf
- AFOLU_PROJ_ELEM_2082_14MAY2020.pdf
- CCB_PROJ_DESC_ENG_DRAFT_PL2082_25NOV2019.pdf
- CCB_PROJ_DESC_2082_14MAY2020.pdf
- PROJ_DESC_PL2082_25NOV2019.pdf
- CCB_Qianbei_Afforestation_PD_070920.pdf
- VCS_VALID_REPRESENTATION_2082_30JUL2020.pdf
- CCB_VERIF_REP_ENG_2082_01JAN2016_31DEC2019.pdf
- VCS_VERIF_REPR_2082_01JAN2016_31DEC2019.pdf
- CCB_VERIF_STA_2082_01JAN2020_31DEC2020.pdf

- 20220928_CCB+VCS_FVR_Qianbei AR 3rd_clean.pdf
- VCS_VALID_REPORT_2082_14MAY2020.pdf
- V2_2082_PRR_22DEC2021 (1).pdf
- CCB_VALID_STA_2082_14MAY2020.pdf
- VCS_VALID_REPRESENTATION_2082_14MAY2020.pdf
- 20211101_CCB+VCS_FVR_Qianbei AR 2nd.pdf
- CCB_VERIF_STA_2082_01JAN2016_31DEC2019.pdf
- VCS_VERIF_REPR_2082_01JAN2020_31DEC2020.pdf
- 2020-07-09_VCS_FVR_Qianbei Afforestation VAL.pdf

Report ID: CM-71E3CE0B · Scoring Methodology: General v2.0 · Scored: 2026-04-19 · Generated: 2026-04-19

carbonmeld.com · carbonmeld.com/methodology · carbonmeld.com/editorial-policy